Performing an 18th century violin concerto today

About playing baroque music on a modern violin in both a way that is faithful to how the work was used to be performed in the era it was composed and fits in the context of the nowadays listener.

Brenda Brouns
Degree Project, 30 higher education credits
Master of Fine Arts in Music, Symphonic Orchestra Performance
Academy of Music and Drama, University of Gothenburg
Spring Semester 2015

Author: Brenda Brouns
Title: Performing an 18th century violin concerto today: About playing baroque music on a modern violin in both a way that is faithful to how the work was used to be performed in the era it was composed and fits in the context of the nowadays listener.
Supervisor: PhD Anders Hultqvist
Examiner: PhD Maria Bania

ABSTRACT

This thesis deals with the difficulties in approaching an authentic style in interpreting and performing music from the eighteenth century on a modern instrument trying to adapt it to the context of the nowadays listener. During this project I will prepare a performance of the violin Concerto in A from an unknown composer, probably Vivaldi. In this I will try to make a compromise between what is written in old sources about various musical and violin technical issues, and what can be found in the score, and my own ideas.

Key words: violin, performance practice, Italian baroque, eighteenth century music
Table of contents

- Introduction 5
- About authenticity 7
- The use of sources 10
- How to hold the violin 13
- Left hand technique 16
- How to hold the bow 21
- Right hand technique and articulation 23
- Ornamentation and vibrato 33
- Musical form and the interpretation of tempo, dynamics and expression 42
- Conclusion 46
  Bibliography 47
- Appendix I 49
- Appendix II 50
Introduction

The last years I have been performing several concerts with music from the eighteenth century. Every time I was in the process of preparing a performance I was wondering the same: What is actually the historic authentic style of this music? How should this piece be played in a historical authentic style? How to realize this on my modern (late 19th century) violin which has different possibilities than the violins used in the eighteenth century?

I encountered difficulties that were related to playing this music on a violin from a later period with a high bridge, steel strings, and a modern bow which is made for late 19th century music to give the possibility of playing tenuto at the tip (a technique that was not used in the 18th century).

In the most cases I tried to find a compromise between what I knew about ideas of earlier music and playing an old instrument and the possibilities to realise this on a modern instrument and different ideas about interpreting early music. At the same time, I was wondering how far it is possible to know what the music sounded like the era it was written, and if it makes sense to try to play music that is composed by composers from the past, in a style that I would never know exactly and in a context that is different than the context of the original performance. Sometimes I really got caught in a too technical approach.

In the course of history there have been a lot of different ideas and concepts about performing music from earlier times. There was not only a big difference in the ideas about the performance of music itself but also about the context in which music was performed and the instruments being used. In this thesis I choose to focus on playing eighteenth century music on a modern - (nineteenth century) instrument, since this is what I do most of the time.

During this project I want to make a compromise between different ideas about performing music from an era before the existence of recordings, from which I never will know what the music really sounded like, and my own ideas.

In this thesis I will first describe some ideas that are written in literature about music and violin performance practice from the eighteenth century itself. Examples are ideas described in treatises about playing the violin by Leopold Mozart, Francesco Geminiani, Giuseppe Tartini and Michel Corrette. These treatises give some ideas about music in general and playing the violin in the eighteenth century itself.

I will also describe how I applied this knowledge in practicing and performing a violin concerto that has been rediscovered a few years ago. The concerto has been attributed to Vivaldi. Since there were no printed parts available of this work I had to make the printed parts and score myself. This means also that I had to interpret the manuscript myself since it was not yet interpreted by an editor. This gave me a lot of possibilities in interpretation.

I will work out different violin technical issues like: Playing with vibrato or not? What kind of fingerings is appropriate? What kind of articulations fit the best? How to play baroque articulation with a modern bow? How to play trills and other ornamentation?
I will describe how this research and preparing the performance of the recently rediscovered violin concerto influenced my earlier ideas about interpreting and performing eighteenth century music.
About authenticity

One of the questions in playing early music, music from a period different than our own, is how to play in an historical authentic way. How to play the music the way it had sounded when it was written and how the composer intended it to sound. This is for several reasons a problematic question, mostly because of the question what authenticity is. Authenticity can be seen as in the sense of authentic to tradition, to how the composer meant his work to be performed, but also as authentic in the personal style of the performer, or in the style appreciated the most by the audience in a certain place and at a certain time in history. Here I will focus mainly on authenticity as authentic to a certain tradition and authentic to the ideas of the composer.

Authenticity is a problematic concept for several reasons. One of the reasons is that in the course of time there has been different conceptions about the performance of earlier music, this has to be seen in connection with the social, technological and historical development and changes.

Before the eighteenth century, the performance of music was mainly focused on performing contemporary music. Music of earlier periods was almost only played as study material or in liturgical settings. During the nineteenth century the popularity of playing music from earlier periods was growing. There are a couple of reasons for this: One of them is a growing interest in history in general in this era. More research has been done to history, and a canon was made of historical events. This brought forth the idea of canon of musical works. This growing interest in history and changing ideas in general can be seen in the context of the technical and industrial revolution, and the social and cultural change that came together with this nineteenth century revolution in technique, science and culture.

Till the nineteenth century, time and history were seen more as a cycle, like the cycle of the seasons, but after the technical and industrial revolution, time is seen more linear because people saw big changes their lives from present till future, in this time of fast technical progression. And if things can change fast towards the future the idea grows that the past could have been a lot different from the present, which makes the past interesting. This is also the case with music. So music of the past became interesting to investigate and listen to.

Other reasons of the increasing interest in earlier music in the nineteenth century can be an unprecedented rise in prosperity, which made a widespread participation in art music possible, the expanding of the middle class with a growing interest for art music, and the fragmentation of the audience in groups with different tastes and preferences, with amongst them a group with preference for music from the classical masters from the past and present who where also interested in music from the eighteenth century. This created a lot of possibilities to rediscover and perform eighteenth century music.

---

1 Anton Froeyman. Historische Uitvoeringspraktijk. *De Uil van Minerva* 24, No. 1 (2011): 1-28 (Applies to whole section from beginning of this chapter)
Outside the changes in the social context of listening to music and the renewed interest in performing earlier music, there were also changes in the way music was performed and the change of the role of the performer and composer.

An important development in the performance of music in the nineteenth century was the ‘work concept’: A composition of music was seen as an independent work of art in itself, not as an act of performance, carrier of text or functional part of another kind of event like a wedding or funeral like before. This idea of a musical work as independent art work is nowadays still a very influential idea.

One of the consequences of the work concept was that the intentions of the composer became more important than the intentions of the performer. The composer is the maker of the work. The role of the performer is to play the musical work as much as possible as the composer intended. This separation of the role of the composer and the role of the performer can also be seen in a wider perspective of a growing specialization in professions. One consequence of this is that since the nineteenth century there were much more details written in the score how music should be performed and less freedom was left for the performer.

New technologies also played a role in the change of the role of the composer and performer. Printing became easier and less expensive in the nineteenth century. This made the distribution of music easier too. Performers could get to know music from far away and were not always familiar with the style and way of performing of this works, so it became necessary for composers to write their intentions more detailed in the score.

These developments led to that by mid twentieth century the notation of a composer had a very big role in the way music was performed. The written text in music was more important than in other art forms like theatre and dance. In theatre and dance it is much more usual to make for example a more modern version of an older story than in music, even if the original version is totally changed because of this. In music it is since the nineteenth century usual to play exactly what is written in the score, no less no more.

With being used to playing music from very detailed written scores in which everything is written down as to how it should be performed, the scores of earlier music in which less details were written down will leave a lot of questions. One of the most common mistakes is interpreting these scores as ‘what is not written down is not allowed to do’ from the idea that if something was meant to be done it was written down. More true to the conventions and ideas of performance, and authentic to the eighteenth century performance tradition, is seeing the score as a guideline which gives a lot of possibilities and freedom to the performer.

---


3 Bernard Sherman. D. AUTHENTICITY IN MUSICAL PERFORMANCE...
At the first sight this seems to be in contradiction with the idea of authenticity as authentic to the intentions of the composer, but this is not the case. This is also one of the difficulties of playing earlier music: investigating the space that is given by the composer to the creativity of the performer. Following the intentions of the composer means here ‘performing a work according to rough guidelines given by the composer and fill in yourself what is not filled in yet by the composer’.

A further step in trying to follow the intentions of the composer as much as possible is not only trying to play exactly what is written in the score but also trying to approach how the music sounded when it was composed by playing as much as possible on instruments or replicas of instruments from the time and place of the composer. Another way of dealing with this matter is imitating the sound of old instruments on modern instruments. Here again the question comes how to interpret ‘following the intentions of the composer’, and also the question ‘how to perform in the eighteenth century tradition’.

Sometimes it is even not indicated on which instruments the music should be performed according to the composer. This means that it is even possible to interpret ‘according to the intentions of the composer’, as ‘it should be performed on available instruments, according to the good taste of the performer’. In this point of view it would even be possible to perform a Bach trio sonata as rock music on guitar, synthesizer and bass guitar... It is possible to defend this as an authentic performance because it was a usual practice in the eighteenth century to play music just on the instruments at the moment available and not strictly on one certain type of instrument. It is also questionable if a composer really would want his music to be played on the old instruments with certain limitations if there are already instruments with more possibilities available.

It is really useful to question to what extend it makes sense to try to restore how music sounded in the time it was composed. It will never be possible to hear the music as it sounded in the time it was first performed. This is the case since no recordings from this period exist. Besides that the way we perceive music and sound has changed significantly. In the course of time there have been major changes in the society, in culture, and in art. This means that the audience in the eighteenth century could have heard the music in a different way than nowadays. In that time people were not yet familiar with harsh sounds like big machines and airplanes or with music with a lot of dissonances like works by Schönberg or Ligety. So what to me sounds like very gentle nice music could for an eighteenth century audience possibly have sounded like some very weird and aggressive sound.

Not only has the perception of sound and music changed in the course of time. The context of performance has also changed. A lot of music that has been composed as part of for example a service in the church is often performed as concert piece in a concert hall with an audience that comes to listen to the music and not to worship in the church.

---

http://philosophynow.org/issues/28/Musical_Hermeneutics_The_Authentic_Performance_of_Early_Music
Since it is for me impossible to know exactly what the music which was composed in the eighteenth century sounded like, and I probably also hear it in a different way since I am myself living in a different historical and cultural context, I made the choice to try to find as much information as possible about the ideas about the interpretation and performance of music in the eighteenth century and combine this with my own musical ideas.

The use of sources

Since it is impossible to know exactly how music sounded in a period before the existence of recordings, all knowledge of performing these compositions has come from analysing the written scores, contemporary treatises in which it is described how to make music or how to play the violin (including for example prefaces and explanations to compositions and ornamentation tables), instruments from the period itself, and writings about techniques of playing from the period itself, and paintings and sketches of musicians. In this thesis I will mainly use treatises.

In the use of treatises and other sources there are some difficulties. With the use of treatises there is the risk of generalisation and seeing them as telling the absolute truth. It is necessary to keep in mind that a treatise comes forth from a certain era, and a way of thinking that possibly has changed in the course of time. Furthermore, a treatise is also written by somebody, a live person with an own idea and opinion. An important question is if the ideas of the author of a treatise reflect a general point of view of a certain style in a certain period or were just the idea of an eccentric person with his own ideas. It is therefore important to use treatises in the same careful way as evidence in court. There is also the risk of seeing one treatise, written by somebody in a certain time and place as a general manual that is valid for performance practice in general in a certain era while it is probably just a treatise written in a certain school in a small circle of performers.\(^5\)

Many times we tend to see the rules in treatises as absolute rules, and we tend to see what is not written as something that does not exist or is impossible. In this we forget that the conventions and knowledge maybe made it not necessary to write about it. This also applies to the use of original scores.

In this thesis I will describe some of the rules written in treatises which are very influential in nowadays historical performance practice. A few of these treatises are *The Art of playing the violin* by Francesco Geminiani from 1751, *L’Ecole d’Orphée* by Michelle Corrette, *Violinschule* by Leopold Mozart (1756), and *Traité des agréments de la musique* by Giuseppe Tartini, which must have originated from the first half of the eighteenth century, since Leopold Mozart used it in his *Violinschule*. This work was probably written connected to his work as pedagogue.

---

Giuseppe Tartini’s Academy for violinists was founded round 1727-1728 and was next to his work as violin virtuoso and composer his main source of income. This was approximately 10 years after the recently discovered violin concerto I practiced and performed during this project was composed and first performed. The treatise must have been written before Leopold Mozart wrote his Violinschule since Mozart used Tartini’s treatise. It must have been written after Johann Joachim Quantz wrote his treatise on playing the flute in 1752, since he describes that the cadens rule in his treatise on playing the flute was never described before while this rule is described in Tartini’s Traité des agréments. This means that Tartini’s Traité des Agréments is most likely written between 1752 and 1756. An other important source written by Guiseppe Tartini is his letter to Maddalena Lombardini. This letter is a violin lesson written in form in which he describes how to work on a few fundamental violin technical issues like bowing technique, sound and position playing.

Geminiani’s Art of Playing the Violin is written in 1751. It is a description of violin technical issues and incorporates several compositions and examples for their mastery. A lot of Geminiani’s style and technique comes from his master Correlli. Until the nineteenth century plagiarized versions where published, and this work has been very influential. Leopold Mozart for example, uses it in his very influential and well known Violinschule as a way to put the fingers on the string with the same method as Geminiani describes in his Art of Playing on the Violin.

Michel Corrette’s L’Ecole d’Orphée was written in 1738 and describes musical and violin technical issues from both the French and Italian school. Especially the descriptions of violin technical aspects like how to hold the bow and violin have been very influential.

Leopold Mozart’s Violinschule is a very influential work about musical style and violin playing, it is 264 pages long and is a very systematic, detailed treatise on violin playing in which some elements by Geminiani and Tartini are described. By 1800 it achieved four German editions, a French (c.1770), and a Dutch (1766) one, and a lot of later German violin treatises where inspired by this work.

I have chosen treatises about violin playing of Italian origin written by Italian violin virtuosos (except Leopold Mozart’s Violinschule and Michel Correttes L’Ecole d’Orphée) since they are the most relevant for the interpretation of the virtuosic Italian eighteenth century violin concerto studied during this project. I chose to use Leopold Mozart’s Violinschule and Michel Correttes L’Ecole d’Orphée since they give some general ideas about violin technical and musical issues from the eighteenth century.

---

8 Robin Stowel. The Early Violin and Viola: A Practical guide. p20-21
11 Robin Stowel. The Early Violin and Viola: A Practical guide. p21
which have been till now influential. These treatises are written much later than the eighteenth century concerto I practiced and performed. However, I still will use these treatises since treatises often reflect earlier ideas, in this case from around the era this concerto was composed. The ideas found in these treatises I will apply in my own modern context of performance. I will combine this knowledge with my own ideas and techniques of performing. My goal is to find a way of performing that both respects the original ideas of the composer and fits in my own modern context of interpreting and performing earlier music.

In 2012 I read for the first time about the Violin Concerto in A, which I studied and performed during this project. I became immediately curious and wanted to work out the score and organize a Dutch premiere on my final presentation of my Bachelor studies at the Prins Claus Conservatoire in Groningen. This performance took place may 2013. Before, it has been performed by the Reykjavik Chamber Orchestra in December 2012. The concerto was rediscovered during a project of the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft to recatalogize, digitalize and investigate the instrumental baroque music collection from the collection of the Dresdener Hofkapelle in Schrank II at the Sächsische Stats- und Landesbibliothek Dresden.12

About the question if the work was indeed by A. Vivaldi musicologists disagree. The Icelandic scholar Jóhannes Ágústsson, who discovered the concerto said that markings on the orchestral parts such as ‘Allegro non molto’ and ‘Qui si ferma a piacimento’ as being peculiar to Vivaldi. Baroque-expert Michael Talbot has suggested that the phrase structure and style indicate a composition by Vivaldi from between 1729 and 1733. Adrian Chandler, director of Baroque ensemble La Serenissima, is convinced the concerto is by Vivaldi since it has a lot of compositional elements that are typical for works by Vivaldi. According to Chandler the concerto might have been written for Pisendel, then concertmaster of the Dresdener Hofkapelle.13

Later Talbot doubted if the work was composed by Vivaldi, it was according to him more likely that the work was composed by the less known composer Francesco Maria Cattaneo. Cattaneo was a contemporary from the virtuoso Pisendel and took over his role as concertmaster of the Hofkapelle in 1755. There are a lot of similarities between the works of Vivaldi and Cattaneo, some elements of works of Vivaldi could also be elements of the work of Cattaneo, for example the marking ‘Qui si ferma a piacimento’.14

Personally I doubt if this work is composed by Vivaldi, it is extremely technically demanding, more than any other work by Vivaldi I know, and the structure of the composition is not very similar to that of other Vivaldi compositions I know.

12 Dr. Karl Wilhelm Geck. Leiter der Musikabteilung Sächsische Landesbibliothek - Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek Dresden (SLUB), email from 03-01-2013
For me it seemed to have more similarities with work by Locatelli, it has the same virtuosic elements and a similar structure. The cadenza/capriccio at the end of the third movement made me think of the capricios in *L’Arte del Violino* by Locatelli.

**How to hold the violin**

One of the major changes in playing the violin in the course of time was the way to hold the violin and bow. This also had a major influence on the sound. In the eighteenth century there was according to different treatises, pictures and descriptions no single fixed way to hold the instrument. The most important was a relaxed and natural feeling posture. The way of holding the instrument was for a large part depending on the style of music or the type of violin played on. The ways to hold the violin varied between positions where the violin was held against the breast, collarbone or neck.

The breast positions (Fig.1, Fig.2) were especially appropriate for dance music, music played on *pochettes* or small sized violins and music that didn’t require position playing higher than third position (possible with extension to E3) since it is not the most ideal position of the violin to play in high positions and make smooth and quick shifts.

Fig. 1: Violin hold in breast position

Fig.2: Violin hold in breast position

For more virtuosic music it is more appropriate to hold the instrument on the collar bone or on the shoulder at the neck. The chin is at one of the sides of the tailpiece to provide additional support when necessary, for example with shifting of position. Some theorists write the chin should rest on

---

15 Kristina Powers. 2011. No Shoulder Rest, Thank you!. *Hemiola07’s blog*. 23 march

the violin in order to help to steady the instrument; normally the chin is than on the right side (the side of the E-string) of the instrument, although some advocate holding the instrument with the chin on the left side (G-string) or, in later periods, almost nineteenth century, with a chinrest over the tailpiece. Another point of discussion is whether or not to let the chin rest on the instrument all the time to hold it or only lean with the chin on the instrument during shifts of position to give the left hand more freedom. This method works well with playing in low positions, but is less appropriate for playing virtuoso pieces in higher positions.\textsuperscript{17}

Leopold Mozart describes in his \textit{Violinschule} two ways to hold the violin. One way is to hold it high against the breast, which is the most ideal position, but not the most convenient for the violinist, since the violin is in this position supported by the left hand which makes it difficult to make a quick and smooth shift of position. The other option is that the violin is held against the neck, which is the most convenient for the violinist. The chin rests here on the violin which makes the left hand free which makes it more convenient to make smooth shifts of position.\textsuperscript{18} (see Fig.3)

Francesco Geminiani describes in his treatise \textit{The Art of playing the violin} from 1751 a way of holding the violin at the breast. According to Geminiani the violin should be held against the breast just under the collarbone. The right hand side of the violin should be turned a bit down to make it possible to play on the G-string without having to lift the right arm and shoulder a lot. The line between the head of the violin and the place where the violin touches the breast should be horizontal and the violin

\textsuperscript{17} Robin Stowel. \textit{The Early Violin and Viola: A Practical guide}. p54 (applies to whole section from p13)
\textsuperscript{19} Leopold Mozart. \textit{Violinschule}. p55
should be held in a way that it is possible to shift of position with the left hand in an easy and fast way without dropping the instrument.\textsuperscript{20}

For the sound of the violin this way of holding the instrument has a big advantage; because there is a smaller surface of the instrument that touches the body the instrument sounds freer. But the disadvantage is that without much practice making a shift of position is quite difficult.

In order to get to know the feeling and sound of baroque violin playing better, I have tried to play on a baroque violin without chinrest or shoulder rest. Just as a try out or practice, to get the feeling and be able to imitate this on my own, nineteenth century instrument. When trying a baroque violin without chinrest and shoulder rest it felt a bit insecure at first since I am so used to playing with a chinrest and shoulder rest. I also felt a big difference in the shape of the neck, and the strings where much lower on the fingerboard and the angle between the strings was smaller, which made it much more easy to make string-crossings. When I got used to it, it gave much more freedom in the sound. Still, for the performance of the Violin Concerto in A during this project, I made the choice to play on my own late nineteenth century violin, since this was the instrument at that moment available to me, and the rest of the ensemble I was playing and performing together with. It would have been too complicated and expensive to get (replicas of) baroque instruments for everybody. I am also used to playing on a nineteenth century instrument and the concert is technically very demanding, and I lacked the time to practice it well enough for performance on a baroque violin. For a later performance I would certainly consider using instruments (replicas) from the era when the concerto was composed.


\textsuperscript{13} Robin Stowell. \textit{The Early violin and viola, A practical guide}. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001, p56
Left hand technique

The left elbow was during the baroque and classical period positioned in the middle under the violin and close to the body. The left wrist was turned inwards, this to avoid contact between the palm of the hand and the neck of the violin to keep the left hand free. It was not allowed to hold the violin too deep in the space between thumb and index finger. This was quite similar to the way to hold the violin which was in use from the nineteenth century. The thumb was supposed to be opposite to the index finger (as were the index finger is when playing an A in the first position on the G-string). In practice it was quite usual to hold the thumb more forward, more towards the second or third finger to have greater facility in shifts and extensions. The thumb should never be too far over the fingerboard.21

A very influential guideline for a correct position of the left hand is the guideline Francesco Geminiani described in his Art of playing the violin. According to this treatise the first finger should be put on the E-string on the place of the F natural, the second finger on the A-string on the place of the C natural, the third finger on the D-string on the place of the G natural, the fourth finger on the G string on the place of the D natural. (Fig 4.) The fingers should be put in these places without lifting the other ones till they are all in place. Then they can be lifted a bit from the strings were they are placed.22 The knuckles should be bend so that the fingers can fall down with the fingertips straight on the strings.

Fig. 4

This guideline to find the correct position of the left hand has been an influential one for a long time. Leopold Mozart for example introduced the Geminiani grip in the second edition of his treatise on playing the violin as a method of finding the correct position of the left hand and finding the right

---


22 Francesco Geminiani. Art of playing on the violin. London: s.n., 1751

place of the fingers in playing double stops.\textsuperscript{24} During the nineteenth century there were introduced more advanced ways to position the left hand and thumb, this to meet new technical demands, and be able to avoid formal shifts of position by stretching. Sometimes the definite concept of position was totally ignored by stretching and playing in half positions. An example of this is found in some works by Paganini. \textsuperscript{25}

In the practice and performance of earlier music it can be very helpful to keep these contemporary ideas of the position of the left hand, posture and how to hold the violin in mind by deciding on fingerings since the fingerings matter a lot in the colour of sound and the character of the piece. During the preparations and performance of the Violin Concerto in A I made the choice to play everything as much as possible in first position, only where really necessary to avoid awkward string crossings or to play in higher registers I used other positions. This to keep the sound and character light, since using lower positions gives the sound a more open and light character than using higher positions.

In the beginning of the eighteenth century unnecessary finger activity and shifting of position was avoided. Much music, especially French dance music required only the use of low positions.

Exceptions were the virtuoso works of various seventeenth-century south German and Italian composers, as well as works from eighteenth century composers like Vivaldi, Locatelli, J.S. Bach and others.\textsuperscript{26} The concerto I focus on in this thesis is an extreme one of these exceptions. In this work a lot of high position playing is demanded. Sometimes it is even extremely high position work compared to compositions like the romantic virtuoso concertos and the capriccios by Paganini. This also causes doubts if the work is really by Vivaldi, as some researches thought. Other examples of eighteenth century works were a lot of high position work is demanded are some of the violin concertos of Locatelli and \textit{L'Arte del violino} by Locatelli. \textit{L'Arte del violino} contains 24 extremely virtuoso capriccios which are used as cadenzas in the violin concertos by Locatelli. The 24 capriccios by Paganini are probably inspired by this work.

Also in works by Vivaldi and J.S. Bach is high position playing demanded. Good examples of the use of high position technique in works of J.S. Bach are the sonatas and partitas. Since these are either works by Italian composers or works inspired by works of Italian composers like the sonatas and partita’s by J.S. Bach it is useful to search what is written in some of the most influential Italian eighteenth century treatises by Tartini and Geminiani.

Both Tartini and Geminiani describe in their treatises how to practice and play in higher positions than the first. A difference between the position playing and shifting of position they describe and the technique of position playing and making shifts of position in the nineteenth century and nowadays is that big jumps and shifts are avoided. They are seen as unnatural.


\textsuperscript{26} Robin Stowell. \textit{The Early violin and viola}.. p57
Geminiani described it in his *Art of playing the violin* like this:

‘And also sudden shifts of the hand from one extremity of the fingerboard to the other, accompanied with contortions of the head and body, and all other such tricks rather belong to the professors of legerdemain and posture makers than to the art of music’

The way how shifts of position should be practiced according to Geminiani shows this as well. Geminiani describes as way to practice position playing the practicing of scales in one position (Fig. 5), going to all positions till the seventh. He writes that it is necessary first to focus on finding the right place, without using the bow. As method to practice shifts he describes that it should be practiced to repeat the same note with different subsequent fingers (See line 3 in Fig. 5). For example a D natural on the G string first with the fourth finger, than with the third etc.

![Fig. 5](Image)

There are no descriptions of how to practice big jumps and shifts with the left hand.

Tartini gives in his letter to Signora Maddalena Lombardini as method to practice position playing to practice a violin part of a first movement of a concerto in one position. Starting with what we now call the second position and repeating this in higher positions. Also here there were no descriptions of making big jumps and shifts or how to practice them.

---

28 Francesco Geminiani. *Art of playing on the violin...* p11
29 Francesco Geminiani. *Art of playing on the violin...* p3
One of the reasons for the avoiding of big jumps and shifts is practical and related to the instruments used in this period. With the violin held against the breast or on the shoulder without a chinrest it is really difficult to make a big shift in a smooth way. Especially when not using the chin for holding the violin. Shifting upwards is easier than shifting downwards. When shifting downwards the thumb needs to be used to ‘crawl’ with the left hand along the neck of the violin to not drop it. Shifts were most time made according to the music’s own punctuation, on the beat, on repeated notes, after an open string, on a rest or pause between staccato notes, or after a dotted figure played with a lifted bow stroke, and they where kept as small as possible. In a sequenza the shift was made for every time the motive repeats. If possible one position was chosen to play a whole figure or an entire phrase. Stretching or contracting was used more than changing of position. About playing portamento when making shifts there are different ideas: some violinists rejected it, others used it in some shifts.  

In the Violin Concerto in A, I avoided portamento, and tried to make shifts according to the music’s own punctuation, after open strings and in a sequenza everytime the motive is repeated. (see Fig.6 and Fig.7 (sequenza)). In general I tried to make shifts as unhearable as possible.

---

How to hold the bow

In holding the bow, the posture had to be as relaxed and natural as possible. The elbow was in general a bit separated from the body, approximately the same distance as the distance between the thumb and index finger when the hand is spread. The level of the elbow was a bit lower than that of the bow. This way of holding the bow resulted in changing the amount of pressure on the bow with the first finger to make differences in dynamics and articulation, more than using the weight of the whole arm to achieve this. The way to hold the bow was influenced by several factors like the style of music, the technical demands of the piece performed, the size and shape of the hands of the player, and the balance and the type of bow itself. The bows themselves were usually a bit shorter, and lighter than the bows that where used from the nineteenth-century (Tourte-bow).

In the early baroque, the way of holding the bow was not standardized yet, and until in the eighteenth century there was a difference between the older ‘French grip’ and the ‘Italian grip’. The French grip, according to Corrette, is a way of holding the bow with the thumb on the hair, three fingers on top of the stick and the fourth finger embracing the back of the bow. This was an early method of holding the bow, and this method is very well for playing accentuated dance music but is not really fit for cantabile movements of sonatas and concertos which require more different nuances than possible with this method of holding the bow. In France this method of holding the bow was in use far into the eighteenth century.

---

34 Robin Stowell. The Early violin and viola, A practical guide. P74-75 (applies whole section from beginning of the chapter)
Another, later, method to hold the bow is the ‘Italian grip’ with four fingers on top of the bow and the thumb under the bow. (Fig. 6) This method is more similar to the modern way to hold the bow. This way of holding the bow became more usual in the end of the eighteenth century, beginning of the nineteenth century, when the construction of the bow became more standardized and the music played demanded more nuances in the sound.  

![Italian bow hold](image)

Fig. 9: The Italian bow hold

There were different opinions about the best position of the thumb: Some advised to hold the thumb near the frog. Others, with amongst them Leopold Mozart and Francesco Geminiani, advised to hold the thumb slightly above it. This placement of the thumb was even used into the nineteenth century when it was usual to keep the thumb near the frog. There were different opinions whether the thumb had to be placed opposite to the index finger, between the index finger and the second finger, or between the second finger and the third finger. The fourth finger had to be round on the tip of the bow. In the eighteenth century the index finger had to be placed a bit further from the rest of the hand than later in the nineteenth century.

---

A reason for this is that all differences in pressure on the bow which were necessary for making differences in dynamics had to be made with this finger. The other fingers had to be resting round on the bow.\footnote{Robin Stowell. \textit{The Early violin and viola, A practical guide.} Cambridge:Cambridge University Press, 2001,p76}

Geminiani describes in his treatise to hold the bow between the thumb and the fingers with the hair of the bow turned inwards. The hair touches the upside of the thumb. Also about how far the bow had to be turned inwards or outwards there were different ideas.\footnote{Francesco Geminiani. \textit{Art of playing on the violin.} London: s.n.,1751 http://imslp.nl/imglnks/usimg/4/42/IMSLP05501-Geminiani_art-of-playing.pdf (Accessed 2016-05-03).p2}

**Right hand technique and articulation**

In eighteenth century music it has always been very important to approach a sound and articulation that was as natural as possible. The most perfect sound and articulation was a sound and articulation that comes the closest to that of the human voice. Geminiani describes it in his \textit{The Art of Playing the Violin} like this:

\begin{quote}
The intention of Musick is not only to please the Ear, but to express Sentiments, strike the Imagination, affect the Mind, and command the Passions. The Art of playing the violin consists in giving that Instrument a Tone that shall in a Manner rival the most perfect human Voice; and in executing every Piece with exactness, Propriety, and Delicacy of Expression according to the true Intention of Musick.\footnote{Francesco Geminiani. \textit{Art of playing on the violin...} p2}
\end{quote}

A characteristic of the bowing technique in the baroque and early classical period were short, \textit{non-legato}, articulated bow strokes. This characteristic depended to a great extent on the bow type and bow hold employed. The most pre- Tourte bows (bows earlier than the nineteenth century ) required more a way of playing with clearly divided phrases and sub-phrases than long melodic lines. The shape of the pre-Tourte bows (curved in the opposite way, lighter and shorter) made it difficult to play tenuto at the tip and keep the same sound during the whole bow stroke, which is necessary to make longer musical lines.

The bowings chosen had a large influence on the weight of the beat. A down-bow was due to the type of bow generally used naturally much heavier than an up-bow so the bowings had to be in line with the wished articulation and rhythm of the music.\footnote{Robin Stowell. \textit{The Early violin and viola, A practical guide.} Cambridge:Cambridge University Press, 2001, p76-77} In for example a $\frac{1}{4}$ bar the first beat had to be the heaviest, and the third beat the second heaviest, the second and fourth beat where lighter. In a $\frac{3}{4}$ bar for example the first beat had to be the heaviest.
Since the down-bow was heavier than the up-bow with the bows used, it was the best to try as much as possible to execute the heavier beats with a down-bow. This is also called the down-bow rule.

Fig. 10 is an example how I used the down-bow rule in ¾ bars in the second movement. The reason I used these bowings is that the most weight is on the first beat, the second beat light, and the third beat light and leading to the first beat of the next bar.

The down-bow rule did not mean that there were fixed rules whether to start with an up-bow or a down-bow. Tartini for example wrote that there were no fixed rules, but that there has to be consistency. If a certain passage was repeated, the bowings, articulation and slurs had to be the same as the first time. 47 This is interesting since there are different opinions on whether or not to play a repeated motive with the same bowings. Tartini also advised to practice fast passages with the bowings in both directions. Tartini advises for example Maddalena Lombardini in his letter to practice every day one of the allegro’s of Corelli. He advises her also to play it with the bowings in two ways around, to practice with both up-bow and down-bow. Also in his Traité des agréments he gives the advice to practice both starting with an up-bow and starting with a down bow, this to get a good management of the bow. 48

Short and articulated bow strokes were mainly executed with the wrist and forearm, with longer strokes the upper arm moved along.

---

46 Anonymus. Violin concerto in A (ed. Brenda Brouns), movement 2 bar 1-6
The elbow was relatively low and the wrist and fingers had to be really supple in order to make string crossings and bow changes as smooth as possible. This was difficult with the type of bow used, especially at the upper third part of the bow.

During the up-bow the wrist should be lifted and the hand bent a little downwards, when changing bow at the frog the wrist must be a bit straightened and at the beginning of the down-bow the wrist must be a bit downwards and the hand a bit upwards. There were no fixed rules indicating to which extend the right hand had to be turned towards the body, although this has a big influence on the amount of weight on the bow and the sound.

As with post-nineteenth century bows the violinist could make different articulations, nuances and dynamics with changing bow speed, bow pressure, the place of the bow on the string and the part of the bow used. In contrast to nowadays differences in bow pressure in order to make differences in dynamics were made by pressing on the bow with the index finger and not by using the weight of the whole hand and arm.

Techniques as martelé and sforzando effects were rarely used; also bouncing strokes like sautillé, spiccato and ‘flying’ staccato were rarely used, only sparingly employed for bravura effects. A dot seems to have been used to indicate a lighter, less abrupt staccato than a stroke or wedge, although the signs for articulation were at that time not clear and often ambiguous. Slurs that were written in the score were more to indicate a musical line, or to indicate a legato line, than that they indicated what had to be played under one bow stroke. In which way dots, wedges or lines in combination with a slur have to be executed depends on the character and tempo of the piece. In a piece with slow tempo/character it is likely they indicate more an on the string, portato-like stroke than staccato under one bow, in a piece with a faster tempo/character they indicate a lighter, more ‘lifted’, stroke. It could be either executed with an up-bow or a down-bow in short passages, longer passages were played usually in an up-bow. Examples of the use of a light ‘flying’ staccato in an up-bow are bar 28 and 29 in the first movement of the violin concerto in A. (Fig. 11 (solo violin part of digital score) and 12 (manuscript)) (Audio 1)

53 Anonymous. *Violin concerto in A* (manuscript scan), Movement 1 bar 28 and 29
Here it is also to be questioned if the rhythm should be played exactly as it is written. Probably the passage under the slur is meant as playful ornament, a sort of bravura effect, which means that it could be played loose, playful, maybe with a slight accelerando. I made the choice to play it a bit playful and virtuosic, with a short, ‘flying’ staccato in the up-bow.

A comparable passage is bar 51 and 52 in the third movement (Fig. 13, audio 2), here is a combination of a slur with dots. Very probably this is meant as notes with dots, to be played as short light notes with separate bow. Playing a passage like this with long staccato under one bow is impossible with the bows used in the eighteenth century. I chose here to play it with the dots, but without the slur as what has to be played under one bow stroke. I chose to see the slur as musical line and play the dots as a light spiccat o with separate bow, since this was much more appropriate to let it sound light, playful and virtuosic. And it also comes closer to what would have been possible with an eighteenth century bow.

When performing eighteenth century music from a score that is already edited, it should be kept in mind that a lot of choices in articulations and placement of slurs are made by the editor and not by the composer. During the project of making the digital score of the Violin Concerto in A, I encountered some difficulties in putting the handwritten text with all its ornaments and sometimes

free rhythms into a computer program. An example is the dot next to the third sixteenth of bar 28 in the first movement (See Fig.11). I added it when writing the score in Sibelius to make it fit in the bar; it was not in the manuscript. When making a digital score of this manuscript, I sometimes had to make choices for certain rhythms or change the meter. An example of a place where the meter had to be changed in a cadenza like passage is bar 207 in the last movement. (Fig. 14 (digital score) and Fig. 15 (manuscript))

It was really interesting to make a digital score of the manuscript of the unknown violin concerto. A lot of slurs in the manuscript looked a lot different than how it would be logical on the first sight considering the down-bow rule. An example is bar 108-115 in the last movement. (Fig. 16)

---

56 Anonymous. *Violin concerto in A* (manuscript), movement 3 bar 202-212
Fig. 16

Here different choices can be made:

1) It can be played as how the slurs are written in the manuscript and in this digital part.
2) It can be played with the dotted notes under a slur with separate bowings and the slur on the last beat (the upbeat for the next bar) for example in bar 109 and 111 (and bars with the same motive) in a slurred up-bow.
3) Or it can be done with a down-bow on the first note of for example 110, 111, 112, up-bows on one bow on the dotted notes under the slur and again an up-bow for the slurred sixteenth on the last beats of these bars (As marked in Fig.16)

Option 2 could be the best option considering the down-bow rule and the fact that playing staccato under one bow is really difficult with an eighteenth century bow and was a technique not yet common in use in the eighteenth century. Although an exception could be made for virtuoso effects in virtuoso concertos like this, which could make option 3 a good option too. I chose option 3, since a short passage of fast staccato in the up-bow was done as playful virtuoso effect in the eighteenth century, and it gives this passage a more virtuosic and playful character than option 2 (Audio 3, 4 and 5, playing option 1, 2, and 3).

A passage where I had to make a comparable choice is bar 69-72 in the first movement (Fig. 17). Here I could choose to play the dotted notes under the slur with separate bow, as short staccato, or as a more portato-like stroke. I chose to play it with a portato-like stroke, since that gives it a bit more a melodic character. The upbeat to 69 was slurred to the first beat of 69: Here I tried different possibilities: to play both the upbeat to 69 and the downbeat in 69 in the same down-bow, or to play the upbeat in an up-bow and the down beat in a down-bow. I chose the last option. When deciding on bowings for this passage I had to take the down-bow rule into consideration.
Quite common were effects like *bariolage*, the alternation of notes on adjacent strings (Fig. 180) of which one is usually open in either separate or, more usually slurred bowings, and *ondeggiando*, similar to *bariolage* but over a potential range of more than two strings. These effects were, with the violins used in the eighteenth century (low bridge, strings low on the fingerboard and a smaller angle between the strings), much easier than with violins from the nineteenth century and later.

---

A total *legato* was only reached by slurs. This technique was little in use since it was quite difficult to reach with the bows used in the eighteenth century. This does not mean that violinists did not try to reach the perfect *legato*. Tartini writes for example in his *Traité des agréments* that in *cantabile* (and *legato*) the transition from one note to the other must be almost unhearable. There should not be an interval of silence between the notes. This in contrast to faster passages were the different notes have to be detached and articulated.

Another important characteristic of eighteenth century violin technique was the capability of making a good swell in the sound. Geminiani’s *The Art of Playing the Violin* describes the possibility of letting the sound swell and diminish as one of the major beauties of the sound of the violin. The most beautiful tones according to this treatise are tones that start soft at the beginning of the bow, swell when going to the middle of the bow by increasing the pressure that is put on the bow by pressing it more with the forefinger, and softening when going to the other end of the bow. The swelling must be made by pressing the forefinger on the bow only and not by using the weight of the whole arm or hand. There must be no interruption at the middle of the bow.

Tartini writes in his letter to Maddelena Lombardini also about the swell of the sound as the most beautiful. In this letter with instructions of how to practice the violin he advises her to practice every day an hour on playing tones with a swell. He tells her to play notes on a scale or open string, begin the tone *pianissimo*, swell to *fortissimo* and end *pianissimo* again and practice this in both up- and down-bows. Tartini sees the ability to make this swell on a tone as the most difficult and important of playing the violin.

Both Geminiani and Tartini write that the beginning of the tone should be soft and gentle and not sudden and harsh. The bow has to be put on the string in a soft and gentle way, and the pressure on the bow has to be increased after the bow is on the string.

About the amount of the bow that should be used there are different ideas. Geminiani for example writes that the whole bow should be used, also the part of the bow near the tip and near the frog under the fingers of the right hand (the right hand is a bit further from the frog). According to Tartini only the middle of the bow should be used and not the part under the tip or frog. He also writes that an increase in dynamic should be done in the middle of the bow, and not at the tip. The same for playing more notes under one bow. This has a practical reason. An eighteenth century bow that is light at the tip is not fit for making a crescendo towards the tip or playing tenuto at the tip.

---


62 Francesco Geminiani. *Art of playing on the violin*. London: s.n. ,1751

63 Giuseppe Tartini, (transl.) Dr. Burney. *A letter from the late Signor Tartini to Signora Maddalena Lombardini (now Signora Sirmen), published as an important lesson to performers on the violin*. London

64 Francesco Geminiani. *Art of playing on the violin*. London: s.n. ,1751
During the preparations of the performance and the performance of the Violin Concerto in A we chose to play in the ensemble as much as possible around the middle of the bow. In the solo part I also chose to play around the middle of the bow, although sometimes I used the part near the frog or tip when it was more convenient. In the second movement I also chose to play sometimes tenuto at the tip to make long phrases and musical lines.

We chose all to hold the bow a bit higher (further from the frog) than we are used to, to imitate the eighteenth century bow hold and have the light feeling of playing with baroque bows and make it easier to play lighter. We did this to come as close as possible to the sound of eighteenth century instruments, and come as close as possible to what is written in the treatises I read about holding the bow, bowing technique and the most ideal sound.

We didn’t always make swells and put as much emphasis on swells as Tartini described. This to make more longer phrases in the music and because of our own taste. We didn’t like it to make too much swells.
Ornamentation and vibrato

One of the most difficult issues in eighteenth century music performance is the use of ornamentation. In a lot of works, only a melodic outline is given on which the performer himself must make ornamentation. The performer was supposed to know the conventions of the time and have a good taste in making ornaments. This is especially the case in works of Italian composers and their German, Spanish and English students. The composer gave a melodic outline and the performer was expected to make ornamentation and improvised embellishments. There are several treatises from the seventeenth century by for example Ganassi, Bovicelli, Ortiz, Preatorius and Simpson in which it is attempted to teach the difficult skill of making improvised embellishments with formulated principles and examples. These treatises give a good idea about this practice, but they cannot capture all possibilities in ornamentation or give absolute rules. A lot was left to the good taste and skills of the performer.

The French style of ornamentation is characterized by a relatively strict way to deal with ornamentation. In the French baroque style the endless possibilities of ornamentation are channelled in certain patterns which are notated in symbols in ornamentation tables. This ornamentation tables and rules are a source of misunderstandings: They are not always consequent and they give the false impression that they contain fixed rules and that there are no freedoms and other possibilities that are not in these tables, so, that in the French style the ornamentation is frozen in rigid and stereotyped patterns. Although the freedom in French baroque is more limited, it is still necessary not to forget the free nature of ornamentation.

The German style is a compromise between French and Italian style. A good example of a composer who writes in this style is J.S. Bach. In his works that are composed in the French style he uses more the French style in ornamentation and in the works that are composed in the Italian style he uses more Italian style ornamentation. Many times he very precisely writes down the Italian style ornamentation. This causes a few difficulties: One of them is how to determine if something is ornamentation or structure.

This has a big influence on how to interpret the written score. If a passage is seen as structure it would lead to an interpretation in which every note is fully played out like it is the essence of the work. If the same passage is seen as an ornament it would lead to that the notes in that passage are played as something that would lead from one tone to the next one. Another difficulty with fully written out ornamentation is the question whether every ornament played is written in the score or if there is still space left for ornamentation added by the performer, for example on final cadences.


When repeating a passage it is the question whether to add ornaments when playing it the second time, to both times play it the same, or to leave some ornaments that are in the score when playing it the first time and only play them the second time. 67

A good example of the Italian style of ornamentation is the second movement of the concerto in A by Vivaldi (Fig. 19). Here ornamentation is very detailed written in the score. It is sometimes difficult to distinguish structure and ornamentation. When practicing it I played only the main notes of the structure, and than filled in the ornamentation to not get totally lost in the ornamentation and get it together with the ensemble as well. In the beginning I just tried to play it and lost the structure in the ornamentation. For the ensemble this made it really difficult to place their chords.

![Fig. 19](image_url)

A common made mistake in ornamentation in general is seeing what is not written as what should not be done.

In this thesis I will focus mainly on the Italian baroque style. I will focus on the Italian style since this is the style of the violin concerto studied during the work on this thesis. Since the subject of ornamentation is too big to describe in a few pages and requires a research on itself I will only discuss the elements of ornamentation I found back in the Concerto in A.


A question that rose when I was practicing the Violin Concerto in A is how long the appoggiaturas have to be. A distinction has to be made between long and short appoggiaturas. A long appoggiatura expresses according to Geminiani sentiments like love, affection and pleasure. According to Tartini’s *Traité des agréments* a long appoggiatura is the same length as the note it is placed for. If a long appoggiatura is written before a dotted note the appoggiatura is two third of the note it is written before. Geminiani wrote in his *Art of playing on the violin* that most of the time a long appoggiatura could be longer than half of the length of the note it was placed for. When the appoggiatura has the same length as the main note it can be distinguished from the main note in the way it is played. An appoggiatura starts a bit soft and increases a bit till on the half of the length and then decrease. If it was a main note it should have more force than the note after and probably a short trill.  

A short appoggiatura has according to Tartini the function to give the melody more brightness and clearness. Often it is placed between the notes of a melody that descent in leaps of a third and fills up the melody. It has to be played with lightness. An example is bar 25 and 26 (Fig.20) in the first movement of the violin concerto in A. Here I tried to play the appoggiatura as light and elegant as possible to give it a playful and happy character.

![Fig.20](image)

In these same bars is also a long appoggiatura before a dotted note, if the rules in the treatises by Geminiani and Tartini are applied on this the appoggiatura would have to be two third of the note before. This gives a totally different feeling of the rhythm than when this one is played one third or

---

70 Francesco Geminiani. *Art of playing on the violin*. 1751. p8
71 Giuseppe Tartini, Jacobi, Erwin R. (eds.), Girdlestone, Cuthbert (trans.) *Traité des agréments*... p68-69
half of the length from the note placed before. (Audio 7) Another rhythmical interesting place in this concerto is bar 107 in the last movement. (Fig.21)

According to the rules described in Tartini’s treatise, this appoggiatura should be played two third as long as the note it is written before, but it can also be played the same long or shorter than the note it belongs to. (Audio 8 (long appogiatura) and 9 (shorter appogiatura)).

When working on this concerto with Johannes Leertouwer, soloist and conductor and a renowned specialist in earlier music, he said that in a lot of cases the execution of appoggiaturas, how long they are, how fast they should be played et cetera, depend on the taste of the performer, the character of the work that is played and also on what technically is possible. Probably this is also how it has been played in the eighteenth century, the nature of the ornament is an embellishment that has to sound free and not as mathematical measured and technically forced. It has to be natural, and on that I agree.

A very important ornament is the trill. Tartini has in his *Traité des agréments de la musique* a very good metaphor to describe a correct and tasteful way to use the trill. He compares a trill with salt used in food. Food can be really tasteful when salt is used in the right amount. If there is too much salt in the food, the food does not taste well anymore and salt should not be used in all food. The same is the case with trills. They should be used in a tasteful way and not everywhere in the music. Like the amount of salt in food a lot depends on personal taste.

Two kinds of trills are distinguished: the trill of a half tone to end a piece in a minor key (Fig.22) and of a whole tone to end a piece in a major key (Fig. 23). Trills of more than a whole tone (Fig.24) should be avoided because they are difficult to execute in a nice and tasteful way.

---

The tempo of the trill depends on the character of the music. In music with a slow tempo, and a singing, serious or sad character the trill is slow, in fast and happy music the trill is fast. Tartini also gives examples of different possible trills. Some examples are a trill that is accelerating towards the end of a cadential note, (Fig. 25, Audio 10) and a trill that is both accelerating and played with a crescendo in a transition from piano to forte and the possibility of trilling on every note of a passage.

An example of the use of trills on every note I found back multiple times in the violin concerto in A in the first movement in bar 78 (Fig.26), and in bar 154 (Fig.27) in the end of a cadenza like passage and in the third movement in bar 70 (Fig.28), and even combined with double stops in bar 129-137 (Fig.29) in the same movement.

---

75 Giuseppe Tartini, Jacobi, Erwin R. (eds.), Girdlestone, Cuthbert (trans.) Traité des agréments de la musique. Celle and New York: Herman moeck Verlag, p.74-75
78 Anonymous. Violin concerto in A (ed. Brenda Brouns), movement 1 bar 78-79 and 155
Fig. 29

According to Tartini trills are in most cases placed on notes which are accented (on the beat), especially when trills are combined with slurs. In case of slurs per three notes the trill is on the second note.  

For example in the first movement of the violin concerto in A in bar 49. (Fig. 30)

---


Not every time the motive is repeated in the sequenza the trill is written, but it probably should be played all the times the motive is repeated.

![Musical notation of a trill]  
Fig. 30

Next to trills there are also turns, and according to Tartini they express happiness and clarity in fast passages.\(^{82}\) I tried to play them in a quick but elegant way, to give the music a light and happy character. (See Fig. 31) (Audio 11)

![Musical notation of turns and trills]  
Fig. 31

In the use of ornamentation a lot depends on the good taste of the performer, which gives a lot of possibilities and freedom.\(^{84}\)

Since vibrato is in eighteenth century music mainly used as ornamentation I will write about this subject too in this chapter about ornamentation. A very frequently made mistake is seeing the use of vibrato in eighteenth century music as absolutely forbidden. Geminiani wrote in his *Art of playing on the violin* about vibrato, he described different types of vibrato and what they express. A big vibrato in combination with playing with the bow near the bridge expresses majesty and dignity while a faster, lower and shorter vibrato on soft notes expresses fear. He even writes that vibrato on short notes only makes the sound better and that it should be used as much as possible.\(^{85}\) Here it is questionable if Geminiani's opinion about vibrato reflects a general idea about style and taste from this area or if he is the only one who is embracing it.

---

\(^{81}\) Anonymous. *Violin concerto in A* (ed. Brenda Brouns), movement 1 bar 49  
\(^{82}\) Giuseppe Tartini, Jacobi, Erwin R. (eds.), Girdlestone, Cuthbert (trans.) *Traité des agréments de la musique*. Celle and New York: Herman moeck Verlag, p89  
\(^{84}\) Giuseppe Tartini, Jacobi, Erwin R. (eds.), Girdlestone, Cuthbert (trans.) *Traité des agréments de la musique*. Celle and New York: Herman moeck Verlag, p 74-83  
Also Tartini makes in his *Traité des agréments* a description of vibrato. Like Geminiani he describes vibrato as ornamentation. He has a very interesting way to describe the purpose of vibrato. He describes it as a way to let a longer tone, especially the ending tone of a phrase, sound, to imitate on a violin the sound of the harpsichord, a bell or the open string of a string instrument.\(^86\)

Both Tartini and Geminiani describe a vibrato technique that nowadays would be described as a hand and wrist vibrato. Although Tartini doesn’t describe a vibrato that can be used often and on all notes, and also doesn’t use vibrato as a way to express a certain affect or emotion like Geminiani does.\(^87\)

During the preparations and performance of the violin concerto I made the choice to sometimes use vibrato on the long, more special notes that I wanted to come out, and to use it to let tones sound more freely, as Tartini described. This especially since I play on a modern instrument with steel strings which might sound a little harsh without vibrato. In the ensemble we chose to play no vibrato in the tutti parts.

---

\(^{86}\) Giuseppe Tartini, Jacobi, Erwin R. (eds.), Girdlestone, Cuthbert (trans.) *Traité des agréments de la musique*. Celle and New York: Herman moeck Verlag, p 84-85


Musical form and the interpretation of tempo, dynamics and expression

Some of the larger difficulties when performing eighteenth century music are the tempi to choose and how to deal with dynamics. Often there is very little written in the score that indicates the tempo or the dynamics used. Before the development of the metronome there have been numerous attempts to find a way to measure the tempo, varying from relating to the human heartbeat (approximately 80 beats per minute, this can vary from person to person and depends for example on somebody’s age) to a convenient speed of walking, to various forms of pendulum. All these ways to measure the tempo were not really reliable.  

Tempo was indicated in Italian words. The most common ones are *adagio*, *largo*, *andante*, *allegro*, and *vivace*. Still, these words caused confusion. *Largo* was for example by some, like Leopold Mozart, considered as slower than *adagio*. These terms for different tempi could have a different meaning in a different context. An *allegro* in the context of church music could be slightly slower than an *allegro* in an opera or concerto, and music that has to be lively and gay in opera or concerto compositions could be cheerful and serene in the church. Another cause of confusion is for example if *andantino* means slower or faster than *andante*. 

In the early baroque era the terms that indicated tempo were more just indications of tempo than ways to describe the mood of the composition. Later the words that indicate the tempo could also indicate the mood of the music. This causes confusion. For example the first movement of the Organ Concerto Op. 4 No.6 by Händel has the tempo indication *andante allegro*. These words could either indicate that the movement is a fast andante or a slow *allegro*. But, if *allegro* is translated it means ‘happy’ or ‘merry’. If *allegro* is interpreted as an indication of mood like this, than it is possible to say that this movement is an *andante* with an happy character more than an *andante* that is a little faster than a normal andante. 

A common way to determine the tempo of dances (like *loure*, *gavotte*, *gigue* et cetera) is reconstructing the steps of the dance that was executed on it. This seems at first sight a pretty reliable method but is less reliable than it seems since a dance can be executed in different tempi. In different places the same dances could be executed in a totally different way and tempo. Dances also could be totally transformed when they were put into the domain of instrumental music. A lot of composers like Bach and Händel left it to the performer to find an appropriate tempo.

---


91 Colin Lawson, Robin Stowell. *The Historical Performance of Music...* p59
That there is so much confusion in the indications of tempo and so many possibilities for the interpretation of the right tempo make that a lot is left to the performer in terms of determining the tempo.\footnote{Colin Lawson, Robin Stowell. \textit{The Historical Performance of Music: an Introduction}. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999, p60}

Both C.P.E. Bach and Leopold Mozart leave it explicitly to the performer to choose a good tempo. C.P.E. Bach suggests as a way to find an appropriate tempo to take into consideration the general mood of the music and the fastest notes and passages, even if that would give a totally different idea of the tempo than is indicated in words.\footnote{Colin Lawson, Robin Stowell. \textit{The Historical Performance of Music}. p59} According to Leopold Mozart every melodic piece contains a certain passage or phrase from which one can clearly recognise an appropriate tempo. If this phrase is played in an appropriate tempo one has the tempo for the whole piece or movement. Leopold Mozart sees the process of finding the right tempo as one of the highest accomplishments in the art of music.\footnote{Carl Philip Emanuel Bach. \textit{Versuch über die wahre Art das Clavier zu spielen}. Berlin: author, Christian Friedrich Henning, 1753 (part one), George Ludewig Winter, 1762 (part two). http://hz.imslp.info/files/imglnks/usimg/6/65/IMSLP59566-PMLP122122-Bach__C.P.E.__Versuch___ber_die_wahre_Art_das_Clavier_zu_spielen_1753.pdf, p58}

The violin concerto in A, probably by Vivaldi is a good example of the standard baroque solo concerto. It has three movements: the first and last are an \textit{allegro}, the middle and slow movement is a largo. The fast movements have a ritornello form with both virtuosic solo passages and orchestral passages. The fast movements of this work are technically very demanding, and in choosing an appropriate tempo it is important to find a tempo that still makes it possible to play the fastest passages with a clear articulation and phrasing. When playing too fast there is the risk that the performance of the work transforms into just a series of very fast notes that loose their musical meaning, or that is impossible to play. Too slow it would sound heavy and not get the light, happy and virtuosic character I wanted it to have.

In the slow movement, the best way to find the right tempo is taking the suggestion of Leopold Mozart into consideration and trying out which tempo fits the best to the passages with fast notes. Here it is important to find a tempo that makes it possible to hear the structure under the fully written out ornamentation, but at the same time keeps the quiet and relaxed atmosphere of the movement. When playing to fast it will sound hectic.

Another difficult issue in performing eighteenth century music is the use of dynamics. In most scores only very little indications of dynamics are given, roughly only \textit{forte} and \textit{piano}. Terms like \textit{crescendo} and \textit{diminuendo} were very rarely used. This led in the twentieth century to the use of terrace dynamics and uniform dynamics for long passages (playing for example a long passage only in \textit{piano}).

Another assumption is that for example a piano followed closely by a forte means that it has to be played with a big contrast and a sudden transition from piano to forte and not with a crescendo. This all comes from the same (post-nineteenth century) idea that what is not written should not be done. Although echo effects were quite common in the baroque era, it should not be ignored that the indications of dynamics served mainly as a framework for the structural design of a piece or movement of a piece with either dynamic contrast or unity between the different sections in which the more detailed nuances had to be filled in by the performer. It was for example common to play a dissonance of an appoggiatura a bit louder than its resolution or make a little crescendo to high notes and a little diminuendo to lower notes, and follow the contours of music in the dynamics. C.P.H. Bach, Quantz and Leopold Mozart state that it is not only the task of the performer to play exactly what the composer has written, but also to add nuances to the music. Although echo effects were quite common in the baroque era, it should not be ignored that the indications of dynamics served mainly as a framework for the structural design of a piece or movement of a piece with either dynamical contrast or unity between the different sections in which the more detailed nuances had to be filled in by the performer. It was for example common to play a dissonance of an appoggiatura a bit louder than its resolution or make a little crescendo to high notes and a little diminuendo to lower notes, and follow the contours of music in the dynamics. C.P.H. Bach, Quantz and Leopold Mozart state that it is not only the task of the performer to play exactly what the composer has written, but also to add nuances to the music. According to Leopold Mozart the performer should not only observe exactly all that is notated and prescribed in the score but also totally get into the affect that is expressed in the music and execute in a certain good and tasteful style all slides, accentuation of certain notes, ties, forte and piano and everything else that belongs to a good and tasteful performance of the piece.

In the way to express music and the way that dynamical contrasts are applied there are national and regional differences. In the Italian style the dynamical contrasts were bigger than in the French style were they were seen as excessive and sometimes even as offensive. In general in the Italian baroque style was characterized as capricious, vivid, rich in fantasy, following the emotional expression of the speech. This in contrast to the more rigid and formalized French style. The Italian style also tended to virtuosity in instrumental music which is clearly hearable in the virtuosic nature of the Violin Concerto in A studied in this thesis.

During the preparations of the concerto I followed the indications of dynamics that where written in the score (only forte and piano), next to that I tried to add some echo effects (if a motive is repeated second time piano), where it was repeated three times I chose to play the second time a bit less than the first time the motive has to be played, and the third time the most.

---


97 Colin Lawson, Robin Stowell. *The Historical Performance of Music...* p54


Sometimes this was difficult, since a certain motive was repeated in the different voices in the ensemble, and the motive in the different voices overlapped. (Fig. 31).

Next to that I tried mostly to use the harmony to decide which notes, chords, passages, and motives I wanted to let come out using dynamic and expression.

---

Conclusion

During the work on this thesis project I discovered that in performing eighteenth century music there is much more freedom left to the performer than I thought at first sight. At first I got stuck in preparing works from eighteenth century composers since I was thinking in impossibilities instead of possibilities. I was only thinking in terms of what is not allowed. I assumed that what was not written in the score was not allowed. Playing historically authentic meant for me exactly playing what is written in the score, and not playing what is not written in the score. However, this is not authentic to the tradition of performing in the eighteenth century. In that era, a lot more was left to the performer. It was even described as an obligation to the performer to add nuances to the written score. It is in contradiction with the nature of eighteenth century music, especially with music from the Italian baroque; to simply play just exactly what is written.

During the work on this thesis project I discovered more and more the opportunities and freedom of interpretation an eighteenth century score offers, also because of the new ways of dealing with the musical score I got to know. During my preparations for the performance of the violin concerto I started more and more to discover the possibilities the score has in itself.

In the eighteenth century a score was more regarded as a rough outline of what should be played than a detailed description of rules what should be played and how it should be played. This means a lot of freedom and possibilities are left to the performer, and at that time it was common that music was played by musicians who were close to the composer, so they knew the conventions and the rest was left over to the good taste of the performer.

So, taking this in consideration playing authentic should be seen more as being authentic to the habits of the period, which means leaving a lot to the performer’s good taste. A lot is possible, also in terms of adding own ideas as a performer. During the preparations of performances with eighteenth century music it is highly recommended to check the manuscript if available, it gives a lot of ideas and possibilities for the interpretation of the work, since in an edited score a lot of choices are already made by an editor.
Bibliography


Anonymous. *Violin concerto in A* (manuscript)


Bijlsma, Anner. *Bach, the fencing master*. Utrecht: Bylsmas fencing mail, s.a.


Dr. Karl Wilhelm Geck.Leiter der Musikabteilung Sächsische Landesbibliothek - Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek Dresden (SLUB), email from 03-01-2013


http://philosophynow.org/issues/28/Musical_Hermeneutics_The_Authentic_Performance_of_Early_Music


Appendix II